



# BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES

Boston City Hall Boston, MA, 02201 (Held Online Only)

## June 16, 2022

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Arian Allen, Ed Fleck, Annette Given, Mark Kiefer, and Wen Wen

**STAFF PRESENT:** Nicholas Armata, Senior Preservation Planner

**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** Alice Richmond

A full recording of the hearing is available at: https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district

### 5:00 PM:

Chair M. Kiefer called the public hearing to order. He explained that, pursuant to the Commonwealth of Massachusetts Executive Order Suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law, that the public hearing was being conducted virtually via the online meeting platform Zoom in order to review Design Review applications. He also briefly explained how to participate in the online hearing.

### I. DESIGN REVIEW

## APP # 22.1068 BH 141 CAMBRIDGE STREET

5:08 PM

Applicant: Michael Maler

Proposed Work: Install mailbox.

The applicant failed to appear.

## **APP # 22.1181 BH 70 CHARLES STREET**

5:10PM

Applicant: Kelly Smith

Proposed Work: New signage.

Project Representative: Kelly Smith presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of

details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the material of the sign and the color of the attachment hardware.

CITY of BOSTON





Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) recommended approval and requested that the applicant paint the mounting hardware black.

COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS SUBMITTED. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, WW)

### **APP # 22.0973 BH 18 GROVE PLACE**

5:20PM

Applicant: City Realty Group

Proposed Work: Rebuild storefront with insulated glass.

Project Representative: David Fisher presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of

details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: Commissioners discussed the type of glass being proposed and the application of the spacer. They also requested more detailed drawings.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) requested shop drawings and opposed the use to low-e glass. Renee Knilans, resident of 35 Beacon Street, opposed the use of low-e glass.

# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO DENY THE APPLICATION WITHOUT PREJUDICE. COMMISSIONER W. WEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, and WW)

- Return to Commission with detailed drawings.
- Low-e glass is not permitted.
- Gasket must be covered. Detailed drawings with dimensions and materials must be approved prior to returning to the Commission.
- All moldings should be replaced in kind.
- Tin roof must remain.

## APP # 22,1096 BH 44 PHILLIPS STREET

5:53PM

Applicant: Maria Correa presenting.

Proposed Work: Replace all windows at front façade, restore transom light, rebuild garden level openings.

Project Representative: Fernando Dalfior presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.







Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the material of the windows and gasket as well as the transom design. They also discussed the relationship of the building to neighboring buildings.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) requested a double door entryway and explained that the proposed hardware was too modern and that painting should be in kind.

# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO CONTINUE THE APPLICATION. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, and WW)

- Regarding the transom light; more research needs to be conducted in order to determine the style of the light based on the architecture, period and architect.
- Paint color remanded to staff.
- Detailed shop drawings must be submitted to staff to determine appropriateness prior to returning to the Commission

### **COMMISSIONER A. GIVEN ARRIVED.**

### **APP # 22.1176 BH 32 CEDAR LANE WAY**

6:27PM

Applicant: Patrick Calhoun, Hickox Williams Architects

Proposed Work: New doorbell (See Additional Items under Administrative Review)

Project Representative: Brigid Williams and Patrick Calhoun presenting. Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the material of the doorbell and the possibility of installing the doorbell flush with the plate.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) suggested flush mounting the doorbell, covering it with brass or bronze, and dimming any lights.

# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER W. WEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 5:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, AG, WW)

• Doorbell must maintain no permanent illumination.

## APP # 22.1187 BH 34 WEST CEDAR STREET

6:43PM

Applicant: Kristin Kinsella

Proposed Work: Paint Front Door (Benjamin Moore 319 Dalila high gloss).

Project Representative: Kristen Kinsella presenting.







Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the architectural and historical appropriateness of the proposed color.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) opposed the color and the high gloss finish. Diana Coldren, neighbor, explained that proposed pigment existed historically and that there is precedent for high gloss doors in Beacon Hill.

COMMISSIONER E. FLECK MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS SUBMITTED. COMMISSIONER W. WEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:1:0 (Y: EF, MK, AG, WW) (N: AA)

## APP # 22.1188 BH 131 CAMBRIDGE STREET

7:04PM

Applicant: Michael Moehring

Proposed Work: New storage shed.

Project Representative: Michael Moehring presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of

details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the visibility of the proposed shed and other possible locations for the shed. They also discussed materials used for the cladding and the obstruction of important elements on the façade of the building.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) requested use of higher quality materials and expressed opposition to the plant wall.

COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO DENY THE APPLICATION WITHOUT PREJUDICE. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 5:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, AG, and WW)

- Install mockup.
- Provide more details of exterior.

## **APP # 22.1221 BH 20 DAVID MUGAR WAY**

7:39PM

Applicant: Teresa Scott

Proposed Work: Replace front door and frame in kind. Reuse existing door handle, lock, number and kick plate.

Project Representative: Teresa Scott presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of

details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.







Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the need for proof that the doors cannot be repaired, the context of the door (sister property adjacent), security issues related to the door.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) believes the doors are original and asked for more proof that the door could not be repaired. Diana Coldren, neighbor, explained that damage to their similar door was due to water damage.

# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS.

- Deny replacement of door.
- Request that the applicant repair and restore the door.
- Door frame replacement is approved.

The motion was withdrawn.

# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 5:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, AG, and WW).

- Replacement of door frame approved
- Applicant must provide evidence from a qualified preservation carpenter that door cannot be repaired to staff. Evidence must be approved by staff for door replacement to take place.
- If applicant cannot provide above-stated evidence, the door must be repaired.

## **APP # 22.1221 BH 73 HANCOCK STREET**

8:02PM

Applicant: Frank Woulfe

Proposed Work: Replace front steps with granite steps.

Project Representative: Frank Woulfe presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the extent of the damage, if any materials are salvageable, the history of the structure.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) supports use of granite but requests shop drawings demonstrating proper reconstruction planning before approval, the different stages of the repairs.







# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 5:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, AG, WW)

- Removal of concrete walls on either side of stairs approved.
- Applicant to provide further documentation demonstrating need to replace rather than repair the steps. Documentation and approval remanded to staff.
- Railing pieces are to remain on site until a plan has been approved for their repair/replication/replacement under a separate (new) application.

## **COMMISSIONER E. FLECK LEFT AT 8:00PM.**

#### **APP # 22.1265 BH 15 RIVER STREET**

8:04PM

Applicant: Johne Souza

Proposed Work: Replace canopy.

Project Representative: Steven McDermott presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of

details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the extent of the damage and advised the applicant to instead replace in kind. The camera on the canopy was also discussed.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) requested the applicant seek advice from preservation specialists and encouraged repair rather than replacement.

# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:0 (Y: AA, MK, AG, and WW)

- Violation must be corrected before work begins.
- Applicant must restore as much as possible.
- When necessary, provide evidence of need for replacement rather than repair in the form of shop drawings. Details to be approved to staff prior to work beginning.

## APP # 22.1286 BH 8 WEST HILL PLACE

8:38PM

Applicant: Colby Mauke

Proposed Work: New roof deck, cedar fence, extend chimney and chimney cap.

Project Representative: Patrick Ahearn presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

CITY of BOSTON





Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the visibility of the proposed roof deck, the positioning of the deck on the roof, and the historic photos showing a visible rail shortly after the structure was originally built.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) expressed concern about visibility of roof deck and chimney and encouraged a mockup. Diana Coldren, neighbor, shared the history of multi-use roof decks and railings in Beacon Hill.

COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS SUBMITTED. COMMISSIONER W. WEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:0 (Y: AA, MK, AG, and WW)

## APP # 22.1290 BH 57 HANCOCK STREET

9:03PM

Applicant: Marc Beaulieu

Proposed Work: Replace existing door locksets with new Baldwin Entry set, Replace existing intercom with new video intercoms (front and side doors). (See Additional Items under Administrative Review)

Project Representative: David Freed

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the illumination of the proposed intercom, the historic elements of the older communication devices, the placement of the device and the materials that should clad the device. Mailbox was not included on application.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) requested a precedent for installing new intercom systems in Beacon Hill and requested that the doorbell be flush mounted and covered with a brass or bronze plate with the illumination dimmed.

# COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:0 (Y: AA, MK, AG, WW)

- Cover intercom system with brass plate with two holes for button and camera.
- Existing doorbell to remain.

## **APP # 22.0772 BH 103 CHARLES STREET**

9:24PM

Applicant: Robert Thompson Proposed Work: New sign.

Project Representative: Emil presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of

details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

CITY of BOSTON

Page **7** of **9** 





Discussion Topics: The Commissioners discussed the attachment of the letters to the sign, the hardware used, the existing/former signs on the structure.

Public Comment: Regina Cockerill of the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) spoke in support of the project.

COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS SUBMITTED. COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4:0 (Y: AA, MK, AG, WW)

### II. ADVISORY REVIEW:

#### **5 WEST CEDAR STREET**

9:33PM

Proposed Work: Install helical supports to façade.

Project Representative: Jillian Borghardt presenting.

Documents Presented: The Commissioners reviewed a presentation consisting of

details, plans and elevations, and photos of existing conditions.

Discussion Topics: Commissioners supported the project.

Public Comment: There was no public comment.

### III. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW/APPROVAL:

**APP # 22.1244 BH 92 BEACON STREET #34:** Replace six, all wood, 6 over 6, double hung, true divided light windows with six, 6 over 6, wood, double hung, true divided lights windows. Paint to match existing.

**APP # 22.1176 BH** <u>32 CEDAR LANE WAY:</u> Repainting of the wood surround in Benjamin Moore OC 39 white and the doors in Benjamin Moore HC 190 black (See Additional Items under Design Review).

**APP # 22.1229 BH** <u>7-17 CHARLES STREET:</u> Scrape, prime and paint the rear windows at 7 to 17 Charles Street. Paint Benjamin Moore, semi-gloss Platinum Grey HC-179 to match existing paint color.

**APP # 22.1253 BH 16 HANCOCK STREET:** Repair cracked concrete piers, repoint mortar 1 joints on brick steps, clean the bricks on steps, remove loose/broken mortar, add new mortar as needed, repair and repaint surfaces in kind.

**APP # 22.1290 BH <u>57 HANCOCK STREET:</u>** Restore front and side doors, Re-point brick as required w/ approved mortar mix and color to match existing; 1 part cement, 2 parts lime and 7-9 parts sand, Clean masonry - water and gentle detergent, (See Additional Items under Design Review)

**APP # 22.1082 BH 20 LIME STREET:** Repair and paint front facade metal cornice to match in kind.







**APP # 22.1286 BH 83 MYRTLE STREET:** Proposed Work: Replace window in kind, remove security grate

**APP # 22.1096 BH 44 PHILLIPS STREET:** At front façade all levels, replace all wood, 2 over 2, double hung windows with 2 over 2, wood, double hung windows

**APP # 22.1270 BH** <u>52 TEMPLE STREET:</u> Replace the paneling & molding of the entryway in kind, repaint the (wood) steps and the door in kind.

APP # 22.1266 BH 70 WEST CEDAR STREET: Repaint front door in kind

APP # 22.1246 BH 5 WEST HILL PLACE: Repaint window and door trim in kind.

Public Comment: There was no public comment.

COMMISSIONER M. KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATIONS. COMMISSIONER W. WEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 5:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, AG, WW)

VI. ADJOURNMENT: 9:39 PM COMMISSIONER A. ALLEN MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE HEARING. COMMISSIONER W. WEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 5:0 (Y: AA, EF, MK, AG, WW)

